

MEDIEVAL SCIENTISTS OF THE SCIENCE OF BALAGAT

Salima Rustamiy Aliybeg qizi

International Islamic Academy of Uzbekistan, Professor, Doctor of the Classic Oriental Literature and Source Studies, A. Kadir, Tashkent, 100011, Uzbekistan
s.rustamiy@iiiau.uz 11, Phone: +998 (94) 608-22-36

ABSTRACT

In development of Human civilization, besides the “exact” sciences, there was a strong demand for the study of the Qur’ān which covered such issues as interpretation, jurisprudence, beliefs and philology. The linguistic views covering theoretical and practical issues have developed in the structure of the philological sciences as a set of multibranch and complex scientific theories like vocabulary, morphology, syntax, the art of speech and its object of study has become the language, linguistic phenomena and the speech, the expression of language. The language has been estimated as a system of complex symbols.

The science of balāḡat (the art of speech) which considered in the system of philological sciences was founded in the early 9th century by Abu Ubaidah Ma’mar (728-824) in the work “Majāz al-Qur’ān” (Periphrastic Exegesis). During the following years this science improved itself and in 12th century a scholarship from Kharezm Abu Yāqub Yusuf as-Sakkākī (1160-1229) joined the sciences ma’ānī (semisiology), bayān (exposition) and badi’ (arts of speech/literary arts) to a uniform system and called it “the science of balāḡat”. The theoretical views of the science of balāḡat that was taught and studied by our ancestors during several centuries are also topical in the modern linguistics.

Keywords: the science of balāḡat, Abd al-Qahir Jurjani, Yusuf Sakkaki, Middle Ages, Qur’an, rhetoric, literary arts.

INTRODUCTION

FORMATION OF THE SCIENCE OF BALĀḠAT IN ARABIC PHILOLOGY

Because of the science of balāḡat was considered one of the most important sciences in the East, especially in the Arabic world, it had long been in the center of scholars’ attention and the level of maturity of the elite and intellectuals was determined by the degree of their mastery of the science of balāḡat [Rustamiy, S., 2016; Gulomova, H., 2020]. That is why the scientists paid great attention to the methodical description of the science in order to meet the social demand for obtaining knowledge of the science of balāḡat and applying the obtained skills in their speech.

The science of balāḡat that incarnated the concepts related to the Arabic language and literature, until being completely formed, each of its components, namely bayān, ma’ānī and badi’ had been evaluating in a peculiar way.

The science of balāḡat originated and developed in the Middle Ages in the East on the basis of the Qur’an. Its components began to form independently based on the Arabic language. I.Yu. Krachkovsky substantiated their independence with sufficient evidence. He tried to trace some marks of the Neo-Persian and Byzantine Greece cultures that might have influenced on Arabic literature at that time. In his work, he came to the conclusion that "it is difficult to say that

there was an external factor influenced the emergence of Arab poetics" [Krachkovskiy, I., 1960].

Since ancient times, the poets' abilities had been improved through special training, poetic skills were passed from teacher to student and a certain style had been formed in oratory. This art of speech, complied with the unwritten laws of the past, began to gain a form of a collated system in the ninth century and was called *balāḡat* [Filshtinskiy, I., 1985, p.247]. The treatise «*Kitābu-l-bayān wa-t-tabyin*» by Jahiz is a work that made a great contribution to the formation and development of the science of *balāḡat*.

Thoughts about the science of *bayān* were first mentioned in the work by Abu Ubaydah (825 year) «*Majāzu-l-Qur'ān*». He studied in depth the words found in the Qur'an and used in other senses than their first, that is to say original meanings. Abu Ubaydah was Sibawayh's disciple and a tutor of Hārūn al-Rashid. Following him, several scholars wrote treatises about metaphor and parable. The science of *bayān* had not been specifically distinguished until the first century of the Abbasid period. Some issues of the science of *ma'ānī*, which became a part of the teachings of *balāḡat*, were partially touched upon by one of the ministers of Harun ar-Rashid Jafar ibn Yahya, some famous writers and orator Sahl ibn Harun. The scientist who was the first to collect the available information into a book is the above-mentioned scholar Jahiz (775-868). Apart from «*Kitābu-l-bayān wa-t-tabyin*», one of his famous works is the «*Tjāzu-l-Qur'ān*». One of the leading scientists in this field of science Abu Abbas al-Mubarrad (826-898) and one of the known writers Qudama ibn Ja'far (260-327 AH) are the followers of Jahiz [Awniy, H., 1953, p.7]. Later, Mahmud Zamakhshari (1075-1144) made a great contribution to the improvement of the science in his commentaries on the Holy Quran.

The first scholar who wrote a work dedicated to the science of *Badi'* was an Abbasid caliph and scholar Abdullah ibn al-Mu'tazz (861–908). Prior to this, Bashshar ibn Burd (696-783), Muslim ibn al-Walid (747-823), Abu Tammam (788-845) and other poets used various types of *badi'* (literary arts) in their poems. Mu'tazz collected seventeen types of literary arts. Yusuf Sakkaki says the following about him: "Remember, there are many kinds of *badi'*. The person who invented these types of *badi'* is Ibn al-Mu'tazz." In the preface to the book "*Kitābu-l-badi'*" Mu'tazz admits that he was not the first to use the term "*badi'*", but that he was the first to study literary arts and write a book about them [Al-Mu'tazz, A.].

I.Yu. Krachkovsky highly appreciates the place of Mu'tazz in Arabic literature. In particular, he says: "The theory of the art of word by Mu'tazz (although not all) is connected with all theories of poetic language. The originality of Mu'tazz's work becomes a question of the originality of all Arab poetry and its independent origin [Krachkovskiy, I., 1960, p.131].

The sciences of *bayān*, *ma'ānī* and *badi'* were divided into parts and chapters only in the next century by Abd al-Qahir Jurjani. Jurjani improved the ideas of his predecessors in many ways and was able to collect and classify the *balāḡat* issues known at that time. He is the author of "*Asrāru-l-balāḡa*" and "*Dalā'ilu-l-ijāz*" on the sciences of *bayān* and *ma'ānī*. Even though the components of the science of *balāḡat* in these works are not fully described, they differ in many respects from the well-known works created before Jurjani.

Scientists have recognized the fact that the science of *balāḡat* remained untouched until Yusuf Sakkaki created "*Miftāhu-l-ulum*", the work in which the science of *balāḡat* was finally formed [Awniy, H., 1953, p.8]. Besides *balāḡat*, the work covers the morphology, syntax, rhyme and

aruz of the Arabic language. Experts of the science of balāġat testify that Yusuf Sakkaki revised all the available data existing at that time and put in good order the chapters. And all the following scientists were based on his rules and in the next century, balāġat scientists almost did not make innovations in this science. They confined their selves to writing comments to the existing works and stating the words already said [Awniy, H., 1953, p.8]. From the aforesaid, it becomes clear that the transformation of the science of balāġat into a finally systematized science and its presentation in the form of a single all-embracing work are the result of the unique works of, first of all Jurjani, and then Sakkaki.

ABD AL-QAHIR JURJANI AND YUSUF SAKKAKI ARE FOUNDERS OF THE SCIENCE OF BALĀĠAT

Abd al-Qahir ibn Abd al-Rahman ibn Muhammad Abu Bakr al-Jurjani was knowledgeable about the sciences of ma'ānī and bayān, the science of aruz, and the Koranic sciences. This scholar was considered a leader among grammarians. This is confirmed by his works, which include, for example, "Al-'umda fi-t-tasrif", which deals with the issues of morphology, "Al-avamilu-l-mi'a fi-n-nahv", which covers the issues of syntax, "Kitab fi-l-aruz", that is, "The Book of Aruz", and also, "Sharhu-l-Fatiha", which belongs to the Koranic sciences. His work "Asraru-l-balagha" is devoted to the science of bayān. Experts of the science of balāġat have acknowledged that this book is the best work on the science of bayān. In this work, Jurjani separately considers the concept of "speech" (kalām). He explains closely with scientific approach that speech is a great divine grace given to humanity. He says that if there would be no speech, the knowledge of a person obtained as a result of interaction with the environment would remain unmanifested; the buds of reason of the rational person would not have exposed his beauty; he might not find out whether the knowledge acquired by him is useful or fruitless; there wouldn't be boundaries between good and evil. Jurjani also convincingly explains the reason for this, that is, in the absence of speech, feelings are in the position of jimad (inorganic substances), a person will not be able to connect with the outside world, things that can be accepted by spirituality remain closed, essences and meanings will be locked in their objects, innate talents will not be directed along the right path, the mind loses control and will be unable to differentiate between faith and godlessness, good and evil, and won't be able to distinguish madh from ziyat and ta'kik from ilham [Jurjaniy, A., 2002, p.13].

Here we can see that Jurjani's aforesaid ideas clearly define the place of speech in human life, its most important function in understanding the essence of the objective reality. In addition to this main task of speech, there are also ethical and aesthetic functions of language. Of these, questions related to the aesthetics of speech are collected in the science of balāġat thanks to Jurjani and subsequent scientists.

The work "Asraru-l-balagha" states that language is a system, and its components, in turn, have special, peculiar systems. Consequently, Jurjani also shows a system of skillful and graceful (eloquent) speech. He emphasizes that the beauty of balāġat lies not in words or meaning, but in the system of utterance (kalam), and that this system includes the style, structure of the sentence, the place of iyjaz and itnab and the need for the utterance (kalam) to correspond to the requirement of the circumstance. He then describes properties of each part.

On the basis of "Asraru-l-balaga" there are controversies about tajnis, istiara, tashbih and tamsil, which serve to achieve the perfection of the speech. The work, in particular, discusses questions about the types of tashbih and the differences between them, the differences between tashbih and istiara, the border between truth and metaphor, mental and lexical metaphor, and other types of metaphor. Scientists who came after Jurjani studied the tajnis not within the framework of the science of bayān, but as a part of the science of badi'.

This work is distinguished by the fact that for the first time in the history of linguistics the system nature of language had been disclosed. In addition, this merit of Jurjani was later noted by European scholars as well.

Jurjani's "Dala'ilu-l-i'jaz" deals with the issues of the science of ma'ānī. It consists of the chapters about hazf and its appeal, fasl and wasl, lafz and poetry, qasr and ikhtisas and an exposition on i'jaz, fasahat and balāğat.

The work describes the thoughts about the poem and the Prophet Muhammad's (s.a.s.) attitude towards the poetry. It also analyzes issues such as fasahat and balāğat, i'jaz of Qur'an, the system of kalām in terms of meaning, its conformity to syntactic content, lafzs like allegory and metaphor, the preferability of istiara and tamsil over the truth, expression of question and negation.

It is clear from the brief contents of Jurjani's works that he combined the issues of puberty known in his time into one work and improved the work of his predecessors in many ways. With this activity, Jurjani made a worthy contribution to the further development of the science of balāğat.

Thus, Jurjani made an invaluable contribution to the formation of the science of balāğat with his works "Asraru-l-balagha" and "Dala'ilu-l-i'jaz". Although the content of balāğat in his works is not complete, it differs from most of works written before him.

By the twelfth century, Yusuf Sakkaki had raised the science of balāğat to the level of a coherent theory in his "Miftahu-l-ulum". According to the data, this scientist died in 1160/555 h. He was born in Khorezm in 1229/626, and died in the ancient city of Almalyk in the Fergana Valley [Heinrichs, W., p.893-894]. It is also said that Yusuf Sakkaki served for some time in the palace of Muhammad Khorezmshah (1200-1219) in Gurganj, and after the Mongol invasion worked in Almalyk under Chagatay Khan, the son of Chengiz Khan (d. 1227) who founded the Chagatay state. After Abd al-Qahir Jurjani, Yusuf Sakkaki revised the thoughts and views stated before himself and arranged the chapters in his book "Miftahu-l-ulum". First of all, it should be noted that Yusuf Sakkaki included in his "Miftahu-l-ulum" almost all the issues closely related to the language and literature, in modern terms. These are the sciences of sarf (morphology), nahv (syntax), ma'ānī (semantics) and bayān (exposition), badi' (literary arts), aruz (versification), qafiya (rhyme). In the part dealing with the sciences of ma'ānī and bayān, Yusuf Sakkaki listed step by step the sections that formed the basis of balāğat and were scattered in the previous works and calls them "ilm al-ma'ānī" and "ilm al-bayān".

The first part, the science of ma'ānī, is divided into five chapters. "The first chapter is called "About desire", the second chapter is "About question", the third chapter is "About imperative", the fourth chapter is "About negation" and the fifth chapter is "About exclamation". The second part, which is called "The science of bayān" includes the issues of tashbih (simile), majaz (metaphor), istiara (a type of metaphor), kinaya (parable). Then Yusuf Sakkaki discussed

about artistic means that make language graceful and refined, i.e. about types of arts connected with the meaning such as tibāq, muqābala, mushākala, marā'at al-nazir, muzāwaja, laff and nashr, jam', tafriq, taqsim, al-jam' ma' al-tafriq, al-jam' ma' al-taqsim, iyhām, tavjih and iltifāt. Then he described types of enunciative arts such as tajnis, ishtiqāq, radd al-ajz il al-sadr, qalb, saj', tarsi' [As-Sakkakiy, A., 1937]. He also considered the arts concerned with letterforms.

As already mentioned, scientists who appeared after Sakkaki note that after this work no one created a full-fledged work on the science of balāḡat, and scientists studied the theory of the science of balāḡat that Sakkaki created and taught their students. According to M.G. Kulieva, by means of this work Yusuf Sakkaki transferred the science of balāḡat to the "direction of logical grammar" [Kulieva, M., 1983, p.153]. Karl Brockelman in his "Tarikhu-l-adabi-l-arabi" lists the names of scholars who commented on the third part of "Miftah al-ulum" [Brockelmann, K.]. They are: Ali ibn Umar al-Katibi (1276/675 h.); Qutb al-Din Mahmud ibn Mas'ud ibn Muslih al-Shirozi (1310/710 h.); Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Dihqan Ali ibn Abi Bakr ibn Ali an-Nasafi (1318/718 h. In Khorezm); Yahya ibn Ahmad al-Kashi (1349/750 h.); Sa'd Sultan Shah (before 1382/784 h.); Sa'd al-Din Mas'ud ibn 'Umar al-Taftazani (d. 1389/791). Compiled in Herat in 1318/748 h.

In the Manuscripts Fund of the Institute of Oriental Studies named after Abu Rayhan Beruni of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan, only one manuscript of "Miftah al-Ulum" is stored under number 7843/IV [Sobraniye vostochnix rukopisey AN SSSR, 1954, p.54]. This manuscript was copied in 1813 by Muhammad Ashur ibn Qurban Muhammad Kulabi. The text is written in black ink by a careless Nasta'liq script. The manuscript consists of 163 pages in size 15X25, the beginning of the work is missing.

From a brief review of the content of the works by Jurdjani and Sakkaki, it is clear that the first work greatly improved its predecessors and the author was able to generalize and classify the issues of the science of balāḡat known at that time. With this work, Jurdjani had a significant impact on the development of the science of balāḡat. "Miftah al-Ulum", written after "Asrar al-Balagha" and "Dala'il al-I'jaz", radically differs from the previous ones in that the science of balāḡat has been supplemented in content; the classification has been done on a deep scientific basis. Moreover, this indicates that the science has been brought to its complete and perfect condition. This work by Yusuf Sakkaki is still a masterpiece of the science of balāḡat.

JALAL AD-DIN QAZVINI AND SA'D AD-DIN TAFTAZANI'S CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE SCIENCE OF BALĀḠAT

Jalal ad-Din Qazvini (1267/1268 – 1338/1339) is one of the scholars who wrote works on Arabic grammar, balāḡat and jurisprudence. He was a judge in Cairo and Damascus, also known as the Damascus khatib (preacher). Jalal ad-Din Qazvini wrote a summary and commentary called "Talhis al-Miftah" and "Izah fi ulum al-balagha" to the part named "The science of balāḡat" of the "Miftah al-ulum". Later, Sa'd al-Din Taftazani (d. 792/1390) commented on this work and called the comments "Sharhu Talhis al-Miftah".

Talhis al-Miftah is a short work by Jalal al-Din Qazvini on the science of balāḡat. Since it was written in a manual style, it is the most widely published book on balāḡat in the entire Islamic

world. It has many manuscripts and editions, which are still attracting the attentions of scientists. The work was published in Calcutta, 1815, in Istanbul, 1844 and in Beirut, 1884 (1885) [Qazviniy, J.].

In this work, Qazvini, first, explains the notions of "fasāhat" and "balāġat." In particular, he shed light upon the issues related to speaker's eloquence and maturity of speech. He then described the three basic parts of the science of balāġat dealing with "ilm al-ma'ānī", "ilm al-bayān" and "ilm al-badi'". These three major sections are started with the words "al-fann al-awwal" (the first art), "al-fann al-sāniy" (the second art) and "al-fann al-sālis" (the third art). The first section, the science of ma'ānī, is divided into eight chapters, which are called "al-bab al-awwal" and "al-bab al-sāniy" and so on. For example, "al-bab al-awwal ahvalu isnad al-habariy", "al-bab al-sāniy ahvāl al-musnad ilayh". The further content of the science of ma'ānī includes the chapters dealing with musnad, qasr, inshā, fasl and wasl, ijaz, itnab, musāvāt [Qazviniy, J.].

The second part, the science of bayān covers the issues dealing with tashbih, truth and metaphor, isti'āra, kināya. For example, in the part devoted to tasbih, the author described its varieties such as mushabbah and mushabbah bihi, in the subsection "Truth and Metaphor" the types of metaphor called mufrad and mursal.

The third section is about the science of badi', in which the semantic beauties (al-muhassināt al-ma'nāviyya) and its constituents tibāq and tawjih, as well as the enunciative beauties (al-muhassināt al-lafziyya) and its components jinās and saj' including husn al-ta'lil are discussed. In the coverage of each issue, Qazvini lists all its types and peculiarities [Qazviniy, J.].

"Izah fi Ulum al-Balagha" has the same contents as "Talhis al-Miftah". In this work, Qazvini explains the notions referring to the science of balāġat, and in the part of badi' illustrates all types and peculiarities of each literary art providing with examples.

The Manuscripts Fund of the Institute of Oriental Studies named after Abu Rayhan Beruni of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan possesses 32 manuscripts of "Talhis al-Miftah". They were copied in a Nasta'liq script. Most are incomplete. Most of these manuscripts date back to the late 18th - 19th centuries. Among them there are manuscripts copied by the scribes Nur Muhammad (1854), Muhammad Asim Khan, Shah Niyaz ibn Avaz Muhammad, Sayyid Fazil Khaja, Abd al-Rahman ibn Khalbay (1798), Muhammad Sabir ibn Mulla Qurban.

Four manuscripts of "Talhis" are kept at the manuscript fund of the State Museum of Literature named after Alisher Navai of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan [Katalog rukopisey gosudarstvennogo muzeya literaturi im. A.Navai, 2006, p.229]. Three of them were copied in the naskh, the rest are in the nasta'liq scripts. The oldest manuscript written in the naskh script is dated 1319/719 h. and kept under the number 402. The remaining manuscripts were copied in the 19th century. In one of them, the name of the scribe Mulla Mirza Kalan Mir Talibbay is mentioned.

The appearance during the reign of the Temurids of the comments by Sa'd al-Din Taftazani (1322-1392) to the "Talkhis al-Miftah" by Jalal ad-Din Qazvini shows that this scientific work played an important role in the scientific, social and educational life of Central Asia. The work is called "Sharhu Talkhis al-Miftah". Amir Temur, who tried to concentrate famous scientists

from all over the world in his capital city, brought Sa'd al-Din Taftazani to Samarkand during his campaign in Iraq [Brockelmann, C., 1937; Mirafzalov, M., 1996, p. 37-39.].

During his lifetime, Taftazani wrote more than 40 works, including "al-Sharh al-Mutawwal", a commentary on Qazvini's "Talhis al-Miftah". This review was written to explain "Talhis" in a simpler way and it was one of the most important manuals for students. In this work the "Talhis al-Miftah" is widely interpreted, because of which its volume has grown so large. Probably for this reason, Taftazani wrote a second commentary on "Talhis al-Miftah" in a slightly succinct and concise form. The language of this interpretation is much simpler and easier to understand than the first one. It is called "Al-Sharh al-mukhtasar".

The Manuscripts Fund of the Institute of Oriental Studies of Uzbekistan possesses 22 copies of "Sharh Talkhis al-Miftah", that were copied in XVI-XVII centuries. The names of scribes as Ibn Muhammad Rafi' Muhammad Rafi' (1679), Muhammad ibn 'Uthman (1568), Nazar Muhammad Haydar ibn Mawlana Maqsud (1584) and Ibadullah Jami are mentioned in the manuscripts.

At the manuscript fund of the State Museum of Literature named after Alisher Navoi of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan there are two manuscripts of "Sharh Talkhis" [Katalog rukopisey gosudarstvennogo muzeya literaturi im. A.Navai, 2006, p.229]. One of them was copied in 1577/985 h., and the second in XVIII-XIX centuries. In the second, the name of the scribe Ibadullah Muhammad Sa'd ibn Haja Sa'id Uratepayi is mentioned.

Few copies of the "Miftah al-Ulum" manuscripts have survived to our day [Bauden F., 2016, p.115.], but many manuscript copies of the "Talhis" and "Sharh" have survived. The fact that they have been copied in large numbers indicates that the science of balāġat, like Arabic grammar, was taught on a large scale in educational institutions.

CONCLUSION

1. The science of balāġat teaches to make speech by writing or speaking of the easy understandable and easily pronounced words that have clarity of the sense and correspond with the situation and the condition of the listener and structured relevant to grammar rules. Here, being of the word "appropriate to the situation and the listener's condition" is the requirement caused by the situation, being of the word "clear, easy understandable, fluent, and in accordance with the grammar rules" is the requirement of the fasahat.
2. The science of balaġat originated and developed independently within the Arabic language.
3. Abdul Qahir Jurjani explained that language is a system, that its components, including the kalam, have their own systems, and linguistic issues such as the unity of meaning and form.
4. By the twelfth century, Yusuf Sakkaki in his work "Miftah al-Ulum" raised the science of balāġat to the level of a coherent theory.
7. The science of balāġat serves as one of the factors that create the opportunity to express ideas of great social significance in literary, philosophical and didactic works in a mature artistic form.

REFERENCES

1. Al-Jurjaniy, Abd al-Qahir. (2002). *Asrar al-balagah*. Bayrut-Lubnan.
2. Al-Mu'tazz, Abd Allah. *Al-kitab al-badi'*. Retrieved from zaza@alwarraq.com
3. As-Sakkakiy, Abu Ya'qub Yusuf. (1937). *Miftah al-ulum*. Matba'a Mustafa an-nababiy al-halabiy wa awladuh bi-Misr.
4. Awniy, Hamid. (1953). *Al-mihaj al-wadih li-l-balag'a*. Dar al-kuttab bi-Misr.
5. Bauden, F. (2016). *Catalogue of the Arabic, Persian and Turkish Manuscripts in Belgium*. Volume 1. Handlist Part 1: Universit  de Li ge – Leiden: BRILL.
6. Brockelmann, C. (1937) *Geschichte der Arabischen Literatur*. Sb. 1–3. Leiden: E. J. Brill.
7. Filshtinskiy, I.M. (1985). *Arabskaya klassicheskaya literatura (V-nachalo X veka)*. Moskva: Glavnaya redaktsiya vostochnoy literatura, 1985.
8. Gulomova, H. A. (2020). Art in Afzali's work. *ACADEMICIA: An International Multidisciplinary Research Journal*, 10(9), 141-150.
9. Heinrichs, W.P. (1986) *Al-Sakkaki // The Encyclopaedia of Islam*. Volume VIII. Ned - Sam. Leiden: E.J.Brill, 893-894.
10. Katalog rukopisey gosudarstvennogo muzeya literaturi im. A.Navai. (2006). T-I. Tashkent.
11. Krachkovskiy, I.Yu. (1956). *Poeziya po opredeleniyu arabskix kritikov*. Izbrannie sochineniya. T.2. – M.-L.
12. Krachkovskiy, I.Yu. (1960). *Ibn al-Mu'tazz. «Kitab al-badi'»*. Izbrannyye soch. T. VI. – M.-L.
13. Kulieva, M.G. (1983). *Voprosi teorii arabskoy literaturi na osnove «Miftax al-ulum» As-Sakkaki*. Dis. ... kand. filol. nauk. Baku.
14. Mirafzalov M. (1996). *Sa'duddin Taftazoniy va balog'at ilmlari // Sharq mash'ali*. Toshkent., № 1-2. 37-39.
15. Qazwiniy, Jalal ad-din. *Al-idax fi 'ulum al-balag'a*. Retrieved from <http://www.shamela.ws>
16. Rustamiy, S. (2016). “Esasu-l-belaga” ve “Divan-u lugat-it-t rk” eserlerinin dil bilimi ve belagat bilimiyle ilgili y nleri. *Electronic Turkish Studies*, 11(20).
17. *Sobraniye vostochnix rukopisey Akademii nauk Uzbekskoy SSR*. (1954). T. XIII. Tashkent.